



City of Davis

**Historical Resources Management Commission Meeting Minutes
Monday, November 20, 2017
7:00 PM**

Senior Center, 646 A Street, Activity Room, Davis, CA 95616
(Southeast Corner of A Street & 7th Street)

Commissioners Present: Mark S. Davis, David Hickman, William Allen Lowry, Erin Autry
Montgomery

Commissioners Absent: Karen Clementi, Rand Herbert, Scott Miltenberger, Richard Rifkin

Staff Present: Staff Liaison Ike Njoku, HRMC Secretary Nancy Stephenson

1. Call to Order & Roll Call.

Vice Chair A. Lowry called the meeting to order at 7:01 p.m.

2. Approval of Agenda.

Action: E. Montgomery moved, seconded by D. Hickman to approve the agenda. Motion passed by the following vote:

Ayes: Davis, Hickman, Lowry, Montgomery

Noes: None

Absent: Clementi, Herbert, Miltenberger, Rifkin

Abstaining: None

3. Brief Announcements from Staff, Commissioners, and Liaisons.

None.

4. Public Comment

None.

5. Consent Calendar

A. Draft July 17, 2017 Minutes approval.

B. Draft October 16, 2017 Minutes approval.

Action: M. Davis moved, seconded by D. Hickman to approve the consent calendar as listed above. Motion passed by the following vote:

Ayes: Davis, Hickman, Lowry, Montgomery

Noes: None

Absent: Clementi, Herbert, Miltenberger, Rifkin

Abstaining: None

6. Written Communications.

Written communications were circulated.

7. Museum Report.

None.

8. Regular Items.

A. 525 Oak Avenue Historical Resources Survey Report (*Commissioner Herbert*)

Staff Liaison I. Njoku: Property is for sale. There was no detailed analysis in the 2015 survey.

Commissioner R. Herbert performed a historical resource survey, which is being presented to the full Commission tonight for acceptance. The survey report was vetted by a Subcommittee of Chairperson Miltenberger and Commissioner Hickman. Finding: property is not eligible for listing either on the national, state or local level; thus has no features with significance in terms of CEQA.

Commissioner comments are summarized as follows:

- Reference to 628 C Street on page 4 needs to be changed to 525 Oak Avenue.
- Need to remove extra period after phrase “like topsy.”
- Not clear if alterations happened in ‘30s or ‘60s. This is due to gaps in the county assessor records. Much of work done without permits. Structure was originally in county, moved into city in ‘60s. R. Herbert attempted to fill in gaps with oral information from current owners, local realtor.

Action: D. Hickman moved, seconded by E. Montgomery to determine that the Historical Resources Analysis (HRA) report prepared by Commissioner Herbert and reviewed by the Subcommittee of Chairperson Miltenberger and Commissioner Hickman is acceptable with corrections to paragraph two on page four as follows:

- Change “628 C Street” to “525 Oak Avenue.”
- Remove extra period after sentence ending in “like topsy.”

Motion passed by the following vote:

Ayes:	Davis, Hickman, Lowry, Montgomery
Noes:	None
Absent:	Clementi, Herbert, Miltenberger, Rifkin
Abstaining:	None

B. 331 I Street Garage and Shed Demolition to Allow a Ground Floor Garage and a Second-story Accessory Dwelling Unit – Planning Application #17-62 for Demolition #6-17 and Design Review #20-17 – Galles I Street House (*Ike Njoku*)

I. Njoku outlined the proposal. Applicant proposes to demolish two existing separate accessory structures: a 230-square-foot single-car garage and 80-square-foot storage shed. Replacement project is a two-story accessory structure with a garage on the ground floor and a secondary dwelling unit on the second floor with a balcony on the south side with a five-foot setback. Commission is asked to accept staff recommendation to demolish structures, provide advisory input relative to the compatibility of the structure with nearby designated historical resources and compliance of project with the applicable DDTRN Design Guidelines. (Additionally, applicant is requesting input from HRMC regarding proposed two-foot setback along the alley at west side rather than required five-foot setback. The five-foot setback is recommended by Public Works Department staff due to potential traffic impact that could be associated with the Trakside project and ACE Hardware employee parking on the alley, especially if the alley becomes a one street. The alley setback of proposed project is out of the purview of the HRMC.)

Applicant Todd Galles: We intend to live there, so backyard is important to us. Two-foot setback still gives us approximately 20 feet between buildings. Five-foot setback makes yard narrow, claustrophobic. When we started project, we thought the setback could be zero with the Planning Commission approval.

A. Lowry opened the public meeting.

Davis resident Rain Watson: I consider all the alleys in the core area of Davis to be historical. Although Trackside approved by City Council, that alley is not necessarily going to be altered from historical use as alley to become a street. Maintain alleys as they have been so they can continue to be used by property owners and bike riders. Important to maintain usefulness of alleys, not alter all around alley to change alley's function.

Commissioner / staff comments regarding setback are summarized as follows:

- Most garages on the alley are at a zero setback.
- Zero setback for accessory structures is representative of historic nature of Old East Davis and Old North Davis neighborhoods.
- Trackside is the driver of the larger setback request by the Public Works Department.
- We should not take a stance on the setback issue; it is not a Historical Resources Management Commission issue, it is a Planning Commission issue.
- Alleys are part of the conservation overlay district.
- Would like to refer to DDTRN Design Guidelines, provide advisory comments based on that.
- Individual comments may be made by commissioners via email. Staff will pass along to Planning Commission individual comments in staff report.

Commissioner comments on project design are summarized as follows:

- How was objection to south-side balcony addressed?
- How was roof line/height issue addressed?

Applicant responses are summarized as follows:

- Objection to balcony on south side was addressed by reducing balcony from 10 feet to 5 feet and by adding more trees, greenspace.
- A gable was suggested, but we wanted low impact. Hip-style rather than gable makes structure appear shorter, lowers vertical wall height. Gives west exposure for solar shingles.

Action: M. Davis moved, seconded by D. Hickman to accept the staff recommendation as follows:

Approve the demolition of the existing storage shed and one-car garage structures on the property at 331 I Street as the property was found by HRMC in May 2017 to lack historical significance relative to applicable criteria for listing of historical resources; therefore, is not eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places, California Register of Historical Resources, or City of Davis Register (landmark or merit).

Motion passed by the following vote:

Ayes:	Davis, Hickman, Lowry, Montgomery
Noes:	None
Absent:	Clementi, Herbert, Miltenberger, Rifkin
Abstaining:	None

Action: E. Montgomery moved, seconded by D. Hickman to accept the staff recommendation as follows:

Provide advisory input on the proposed replacement project to be passed on to Planning Commission relative to:

- Compatibility with the designated historical resources at 405 J Street (Merit Resource, McBride home), 334 I Street (Landmark, Schmeiser house), 320 I

Street (Landmark, William-Drummond-Rorvick house) and 923 3rd Street (Merit Resource, Montgomery house), and

- Compliance with the applicable DDTRN Design Guidelines, subject to the findings and conditions contained in this report.

Motion passed by the following vote:

Ayes:	Davis, Hickman, Lowry, Montgomery
Noes:	None
Absent:	Clementi, Herbert, Miltenberger, Rifkin
Abstaining:	None

9. Adjourn.

The next meeting will be January 22, 2018 at the Senior Center Activity Room, 646 A Street, Davis, CA 95616 (southeast corner of A Street and 7th Street) at 7:00 p.m.

The meeting was adjourned at 7:50 p.m.