Appendix B
Historical Effects Analysis Study (2018)
HISTORICAL EFFECTS ANALYSIS STUDY OF
APN. 070-244-004-000; 070-244-006-000, & 070-244-005-000,
503, 509, AND 515 FIRST STREET, DAVIS,
YOLO COUNTY, CALIFORNIA 95616

JUNE 2018

PREPARED FOR:
Beta Epsilon Association of Theta Xi
P.O. Box 4450
Davis, CA 95617

PREPARED BY:
Historic Resource Associates
2001 Sheffield Drive
El Dorado Hills, CA 95762
FIGURES

Figure 1: Project Location Map.
Figure 2: Project Parcel Map.
Figure 3: Jackson House.
Figure 4: Jackson House Garage.
Figure 5: Bryson House.
Figure 6: TX Main House.
Figure 7: Sketch of 3 Fraternity Houses.
Figure 8: View looking east along 1st Street with 503, 509, and 515 1st Street on the left just beyond D Street, circa 1920s.
Figure 9: Photograph of 515 1st Street not long after its purchase by Theta Xi Fraternity in the 1950s.
Figure 10: Photograph of 515 1st Street in the 1970s.
Figure 11: Current view of 515 1st Street with the altered porch or veranda.
I. INTRODUCTION AND PURPOSE

This summary is provided in accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines §15123. As stated in CEQA Guidelines §15123(a) “an Environmental Impact Report (EIR) shall contain a brief summary of the proposed actions and its consequences.” As required by the Guidelines, this section includes: (1) a summary description of the affected cultural resources, (2) recommended alternatives, and (3) possible mitigation measures.

II. PROJECT LOCATION

The subject properties are located at 503, 509, and 515 First Street, Davis, Yolo County, California. The properties lie within Assessor's Parcel Numbers (APN) 070-244-004-000; 070-244-006-000, & 070-244-005-000 and are owned by the Beta Epsilon Association of Theta Xi, a fraternity associated with University of California, Davis (UCD). There is one Merit Resource within 300’ of the subject properties – Boy Scout Hut (#1282), located at 616 First Street.

III. PROJECT HISTORY AND DESCRIPTION

The existing Theta Xi Fraternity currently occupies three adjacent parcels containing three dwellings located on First Street between D Street and the Natsoulas Gallery Building (Figures 1 and 2). The three parcels at 503, 509, and 515 First Street are owned by the Beta Epsilon Association of Theta Xi, a non-profit California corporation, and occupied by the fraternity. The site has provided student housing dating from 1950, when Theta Xi acquired the first of the three parcels. From west to east are the “Jackson House,” the “Bryson House,” and the “TX Main House.” There is also a detached garage structure that includes an attached laundry room in the northwest corner behind the Jackson House.

The redevelopment proposal anticipates demolition of the Bryson and Jackson houses and garage, as well as lot line adjustments to create two parcels of approximately equal width, with addresses of 515 and 521 First Street. This will allow for construction of a more compact, consolidated singular fraternity building, creating a more urban edge, consistent with city planning goals for the neighborhood. The architectural theme recalls the Craftsman Bungalow style of the houses being replaced. During construction, the TX Main House will continue to serve the fraternity’s housing and study needs. Once the new fraternity building is completed, the fraternity will consolidate all of its activities onto the new western parcel, and the TX Main House, along with its expanded lot, will be vacated and made available for another tenant with a higher and better use redevelopment proposal. Construction is anticipated to commence in June 2019 and be completed in time for occupancy when the fall term begins at UCD in September 2020.
FIGURE 1: Project Location Map
(Courtesy Bole and Associates, 2014).
FIGURE 2: Project Parcel Map
(City of Davis Building Department Records).
The three houses are two-story, wood framed buildings constructed approximately 100 years ago. While the Jackson and Bryson Houses represent a classic Craftsman Bungalow style of architecture, the TX Main House reflects Mediterranean style Revivalist architecture that garnered popularity in Davis during the late 1910s through 1930s.

The Jackson House, located at 503 First Street, was constructed about 1912 and appears to have originally been a single-story house with a large attic and a partial basement. The Jackson House has a horizontal board exterior wood siding. The shed roof dormer centered on the roof facing First Street had no veranda, railing or outside access when the house was built; these features were added by the current owner. The original brick fireplace was removed from the east wall by the current owner. Figure 4 is a photograph of the garage.

*FIGURE 3: Jackson House.*

*FIGURE 4: Jackson House Garage.*
The Bryson House (Figure 5) at 509 First Street is of similar design and was built in the same time frame as the Jackson House, but with a second-story living area. The Bryson House also has a horizontal board exterior wood siding. The house has a partial basement. One of the truncated wood columns was removed, as was the brick fireplace from the east wall. The current railing is a more recent addition, as is the door to the right of the front door. The Bryson House was named in honor of Ellen Loree “Cookie” Bryson, the fraternity’s initial cook who served in that capacity for about 18 years.

![Bryson House](image)

**FIGURE 5: Bryson House.**

The original two western structures that housed the Beta Epsilon Chapter of Theta Xi Fraternity at what was then 503 and 509 First Street were built about 1912 and represented a classic Craftsman Bungalow style of architecture. The original eastern structure at what was then 515 First Street was built in 1920 and reflected a Mediterranean Revivalist style of architecture. In that era, First Street was part of the Lincoln Transcontinental Highway, later named US 40, before it was abandoned for present day Interstate 80. All three residential properties were converted to fraternity housing in the decade of the 1950s, beginning with 515 First Street and continuing westward. From 1950 through 2019, over 1,300 undergraduate men of Theta Xi called those three houses their home away from home, changing rooms and roommates at the end of each term.
The Jackson House was named in honor of W. Turrentine “Turpie” Jackson, the fraternity’s long-time advisor who served in that capacity for over 47 years. He was an internationally renowned Western historian, author of numerous books, and a professor of History at UCD. His scholarly interest in the transportation, natural resources and economics of the American West earned him numerous awards for his promotion of history. Turpie was the rock that the men of Theta Xi clung to, their mentor, their moral compass, and their cheerleader, both during their college days and afterward. He was fiercely proud of his boys and of the men whom they became, successful in their own chosen professions as teachers, professors, doctors, lawyers, veterinarians, engineers, scientists, farmers, ranchers, business men, bankers and many other walks of life.

FIGURE 6: TX Main House.

All three houses are two-story wood framed buildings. Each has a covered front porch with a balcony above and a partial basement. The buildings are set up dorm style, with each having several bedrooms and community bathrooms. The 1st floor of the TX Main House has a large kitchen and a large community dining room. The Jackson and Bryson Houses do not have kitchens or large community rooms. The roofing for all three houses is composed of composite shingles supported by sheathing over rafters. The walls of all three house are composed of 2x4 rough sawn redwood joists. The floor joists are supported by a perimeter foundation wall, basement walls, and by 4x6 girders running orthogonal to the joists. The girders are supported by piers and pad footings and posts which extend down into the basement. The foundation for each house is similar. The basement wall thicknesses are all approximately 8 inches. The basements of the Jackson and Bryson Houses are located below the back half of the buildings, while the basement of the TX Main House is located towards the central portion of the structure.
The project site is flat and currently consists of three parcels. The westernmost lot is paved between the sidewalk and the structure for off-street parking. The area has several trees scattered about. There is a paved recreation/patio area behind the two houses and the front area is landscaped with shrubbery and lawn. The site is bounded by a mix of uses and facilities. Adjacent parcels include a funeral home on D Street and an art gallery on First Street, adjacent to the eastern lot owned by the fraternity on which the TX Main House is located. The project site faces a landscaped buffer and the back of a retail building in a shopping plaza on the south side of First Street. The surrounding area is a mix of retail, single family, and apartment developments along First Street and D and E Streets.

Since 1950, over 1,300 undergraduate men of Theta Xi called the TX Main House, the Bryson House, and the Jackson House their home away from home. As part of the proposed project, the applicant proposes to commemorate the original structures that housed the fraternity with a suitable, prominently displayed commemorative plaque containing a sketch of the houses and a summary of the fraternity’s history similar to the following:

![FIGURE 7: Sketch of the 3 Fraternity Houses.](image)

Specifically, the objectives of the proposed project are to:

- Address deficiencies in the structural integrity of the three houses used to house the undergraduate members of Theta Xi Fraternity on First Street in Davis, CA, as identified in the report by Pemberton Engineering, dated July 27, 2016;
- Renovate the subject properties in a way that provides for the needs of UCD students by ensuring that housing is competitive both in rent and amenities available within the City of Davis, including on-campus housing, in order to ensure the sustainability of the fraternity;
- Use the value embedded in the three owned lots to assist in funding the renovation project by consolidating the housing needs of the fraternity onto a smaller footprint;
- Construct the new building with features that will allow it to achieve a high level of energy efficiency and reduce ongoing maintenance costs; and
• Continue to use the new facility as classrooms that, through fellowship and alumni guidance, lead to the wholesome mental, moral, physical and spiritual growth that is the purpose of the Theta Xi Fraternity.

The proposal calls for consolidating all living and study areas into a single new 3-story building with partial basement, a detached laundry and storage building and trash enclosure, and associated site landscaping with exterior meeting and gathering spaces. There will also be a dedicated “Bike Barn” with bike maintenance space and a one-to-one ratio of covered and secured bike storage to beds. Additional guest bike parking is planned for the city landscape strip on First Street. It includes a new parking lot accessed from D Street through a secured vehicle gate. The new concealed off-street parking and recreation area in the rear significantly increases the number of conforming off-street parking spaces available to the fraternity. The number of beds housing the fraternity would be reduced from 38 to 35; the densification of the parcel would be increased by 50%.

The proposed redevelopment would be handicap-accessible, safer and incorporate state-of-the-art energy efficiency measures. Sustainable design features will include high levels of envelope insulation, high efficiency HVAC, LED lighting, solar shading devices, EV charging outlets and a low water use landscaping and irrigation system. Landscaped bio-swales are proposed to be incorporated into the First and D Street landscaping edges. It is anticipated that the project will target a “LEED Silver” equivalency.

IV. REGULATORY FRAMEWORK

CEQA Section 15064.5(a) defines a “historical resource” as a resource that meets one or more of the following criteria:

- Listed in, or eligible for listing in, the California Register;
- Listed in a local register of historical resources (as defined at Public Resources Code Section 5020.1(k));
- Identified as significant in a historical resource survey meeting the requirements of Section 5024.1(g) of the Public Resources Code; or
- Determined to be a historical resource by a project’s lead agency (CCR Title 14(3) Section 15064.5(a)).

A historical resource consists of “Any object, building, structure, site, area, place, record, or manuscript which a lead agency determines to be historically significant or significant in the architectural, engineering, scientific, economic, agricultural, educational, social, political, military, or cultural annals of California. Generally, a resource shall be considered by the lead
agency to be ‘historically significant’ if the resource meets the criteria for listing in the California Register of Historical Resources.”

If an impact to a historical or archaeological resource is significant, CEQA requires feasible measures to minimize the impact. Mitigation must avoid or substantially lessen the physical impact that the project will have on the resource. Generally, the use of drawings, photographs, and/or displays does not mitigate the physical impact on the environment caused by demolition or destruction of a historical resource. However, CEQA requires that all feasible mitigation be undertaken even if it does not mitigate impacts to a less than significant level.

The California Register of Historical Resources (California Register) is an authoritative guide to cultural resources that must be considered when a government agency undertakes a discretionary action subject to CEQA. The California Register helps government agencies identify and evaluate California’s historical resources, and indicates which properties are to be protected, to the extent prudent and feasible, from substantial adverse change. Any resource listed in, or eligible for listing in, the California Register is to be taken into consideration during the CEQA process. A significant environmental impact would result to cultural resources if a proposed project were to: cause a substantial adverse change in the significance of a historic resource as defined in CEQA Guidelines §15064.5.

V. FINDING OF SIGNIFICANCE

All three properties were formally recorded in 1996 by Bridget Maley of Architectural Resources Group; in 2003 by Roland-Nawi Associates; and in 2015 by Rand Herbert.1 In October 2016, Historic Resource Associates completed a “Historical Analysis” of the three aforementioned properties on First Street. The primary objective was to augment the previous recordation of each building, correct any inaccuracies regarding the historic or physical integrity of the buildings, and make a more defensible finding of each properties significance.2 The properties at 503 and 509 First Street were recently assigned a NRHP status of code of 5D2, while 515 First Street was recently assigned a NRHP status code of 5D3.3

The disparity between the status codes appears to reflect a difference in whether the properties "appear" to be contributors to a local historic district based upon survey evaluation, as is the case with 503 and 509 First Street, or, in the case of 515 First Street, where the property is "eligible"

---


2 Historic Resource Associates. Analysis Study of 503, 509, and 515 1st Street, Davis, Yolo County, California 95616. Prepared for Beta Epsilon Association of Theta Xi, P.O. Box 4450, Davis, CA 95617. October 2016.

for local listing or designation. In either case, all three properties retain adequate integrity to be considered “Merit Resources” within the City of Davis, significant for their architecture and association with U.C. Davis. All have housed members of the fraternity since the 1950s. Besides the Theta XI Fraternity, who has owned and occupied the three residences since the 1950s, the Jackson House is associated with the Anderson family of Davis, particularly A. Gordon Anderson, who served on the Board of Trustees, the precursor to the city council and as mayor. Gordon’s descendants, Don Anderson and Don’s daughter Jennifer Anderson, have continuously run Davis Lumber & Hardware Company, today known as Davis Ace, and like their parents have played an important role in community’s civic and economic development.

**FIGURE 8:** View looking east along 1st Street with 503, 509, and 515 1st Street on the left just beyond D Street, circa 1920s (courtesy Theta Xi Fraternity).

---


5 Anderson Road in Davis bears the name the family.
FIGURE 9: Photograph of 515 1st Street not long after its purchase by Theta Xi Fraternity in the 1950s. Note the half porch, clipped roof off the porch, and pergola to the right (courtesy Theta Xi Fraternity).

FIGURE 10: Photograph of 515 1st Street in the 1970s. Note the original half porch, clipped roof off the porch, and pergola to the right were still intact (courtesy Theta Xi Fraternity).
All three properties, located at 503, 509, and 515 First Street, are currently listed as significant historical resources under CEQA, having been determined to be eligible for the California Register of Historic Resources. This finding was addressed in 2015, when Rich Rifkin and Rand Herbert reassessed each property as part of the updated historic resource inventory, and again in October 2016 by Historic Resource Associates. However, due to time constraints, neither Rifkin or Herbert were able to carefully research the three properties in terms of their ownership, date of construction, or integrity. The study by Historic Resource Associates in 2016 analyzed in more detail the integrity of each property as described below:

**503 1st Street** retains overall good integrity of design, materials, workmanship, association, setting, feeling, and location. The most serious alteration is opening what was once a closed dormer to a rooftop access porch/dormer on the front façade. Other alterations that have changed the character of the residence include removal of the exterior brick fireplace on the east elevation and the addition of an exterior wooden stairway leading to the second-story, where a door has been cut into the sidewall for access. The entire interior design is radically altered since its original configuration. While condition issues were addressed by Pemberton Engineering, none of those issues have dramatically altered the historic character of the residence. Structural issues, however, are identified throughout the residence, and the living environment for students is consistent with the age of the building.

---

509 1st Street retains overall good integrity of design, materials, workmanship, association, setting, feeling, and location. The most serious alterations are the addition of a second door entrance on the front façade and removal of one of the original truncated wood porch columns. Much like 503 1st Street, the entire interior of 509 1st Street has been altered. While condition issues were addressed by Pemberton Engineering, none of those issues have dramatically altered the historic character of the residence. Structural issues, however, are identified throughout the residence, and the living environment for students is consistent with the age of the building.

515 1st Street is the largest of the three buildings and serves as the primary kitchen and meeting hall. The building retains marginal integrity of design, materials, workmanship, but good integrity of association, setting, feeling, and location. The most serious alterations include the demolition of the original front veranda and pergola, the construction of a much larger veranda that alters the front fenestration and design of the front of the house, the construction of a similar style veranda on the west elevation of the building, and the addition of rear access stairs on the rear of the building. Unlike 503 and 509 1st Street, the interior of 515 1st Street is fairly original, and the rooms are more spacious. While condition issues were addressed by Pemberton Engineering, none of those issues have dramatically altered the historic character of the residence. Structural issues, however, are identified throughout the residence, and the living environment for students is consistent with the age of the building.

VI. CEQA FINDING AND PROJECT ALTERNATIVES

Because the buildings are significant resources or historic properties, demolition of the buildings is a significant impact under CEQA. Alternatives 1-4 will not result in a significant adverse effect to the historic properties. Although the loss of a historic building is generally unmitigable, project alternatives should be taken into consideration, along with mitigation measures. Furthermore, the potential loss through demolition of two of the three historically significant buildings may warrant a focused Environmental Impact Report (EIR).

Demolition under Alternative 5 would not result in a significant adverse effect, either directly or indirectly, to the Boy Scout Hut (#1282) at 616 First Street, a Merit Resource. The Boy Scout Hut is screened by mature trees and its significance is not tangent to the three aforementioned properties.
VII. SIGNIFICANT EFFECTS AND MITIGATION MEASURES

A. Alternatives Considered

Several alternatives were considered and rejected for the Theta Xi Fraternity Project, because they would not meet basic project objectives and/or were determined to be infeasible for technological, environmental, legal, social, or other reasons.

1. No Project Alternative

This alternative focused on what would reasonably be expected to occur in the foreseeable future if the project were not approved, based on current plans and consistent with available infrastructure and public services. Under the “No Project” alternative, the fraternity would continue to use its existing facilities on First Street as long as safe use could be assured and as long as the fraternity continued to attract new members. It currently suffers from not being able to compete with amenities offered by alternative housing in Davis. Continued deterioration of the existing property would exacerbate this problem. Without the ability to extract value from the existing properties, as would occur by consolidating the fraternity’s activities on a smaller footprint as the proposed project would do, the fraternity would not have the resources to modify significantly the existing facilities to make them competitive with alternative housing options available to UCD students. The no project alternative would not enable the fraternity to correct structural deficiencies, lower its ongoing maintenance costs, or attract new members to ensure its survivability or sustainability, all of which are project objectives. The “No Project” alternative would not meet the basic project objectives.

This alternative is infeasible because it would not meet the project objectives, would result in the continued deterioration of the properties, and would threaten the future safety of the occupants of the existing structures and the continued existence of the Theta Xi Fraternity. This Alternative, however, would not result in a significant adverse effect to any of the buildings owned by Theta Xi Fraternity.

2. New Construction at an Alternative Location

This alternative would involve purchasing land and constructing the proposed facilities at an alternative location. The alternative would be very similar to the proposed project, except that: 1) the facility would not be constructed on First Street in an area determined to be ideally situated among the campus, the downtown area, and the Amtrak Railroad Station; and 2) the project would be more expensive because of land acquisition costs that would either include costs for previously installed infrastructure (e.g., roads, sewer, flood control, utilities, etc.), but could also necessitate expenditures for required infrastructure if the infrastructure has not been previously provided. The
owner has not been able to identify a potential site for acquisition that meets the fraternity’s requirements. Because of the size of the rural nature of land surrounding UC Davis and the City of Davis, any potential land acquisition would be at a considerable distance from campus and much farther away from downtown Davis and the Amtrak Station. This alternative could have additional environmental impacts because of increased construction impacts (noise, air quality, water runoff, etc.) stemming from the provision of the basic infrastructure.

This alternative was rejected as infeasible, because it would establish a location that would not be an attractive location to members or prospective members of the fraternity or competitive with available alternative housing available to students of UCD. This Alternative would not result in a significant adverse effect to the any of the buildings owned by Theta Xi Fraternity. However, this Alternative would not result in preservation of the buildings either and would likely result in the sale of the buildings as part of the Theta Xi Fraternity.

3. Acquisition and Remodeling of Existing Improved Property at an Alternative Location

This alternative would involve purchasing existing improved property in an area with a comparable proximity to the campus, the downtown area, and the Amtrak Station and remodeling it to meet the needs of the fraternity. An affordable site for potential acquisition was not identified as being on the market and is unlikely to be on the market now or in the near future. Even if such a site were to be identified, expected neighborhood opposition to a proposed location of a fraternity in the neighborhood would be anticipated and would present a substantial obstacle to implementation. This alternative was rejected because it cannot be reasonably ascertained and it is considered remote and speculative.

This Alternative would not result in a significant adverse effect to the any of the buildings owned by Theta Xi Fraternity. However, this Alternative would not result in preservation of the buildings either and would likely result in the sale and loss of the buildings as part of the Theta Xi Fraternity.

4. Preservation Alternative

This alternative would involve preserving and renovating all three fraternity buildings, thus addressing the potential adverse effect of the loss of any or all of the fraternity buildings as a result of demolition or other factors, including neglect. While this alternative retains all three buildings in their current exterior design, it does not address deficiencies as a result of recommendations made by Pemberton Engineering of Davis, who conducted a structural/engineering study of the buildings in 2017. Nor does this alternative meet the current and future needs of the Theta Xi Fraternity in regards to providing a safe, secure, and livable space for its fraternity members. In summary, this alternative suffers from the same deficiencies described in the “No Project Alternative” discussed above and would not meet the basic project objectives. It too is infeasible for the same reasons described in the “No Project Alternative.”
5. Relocating or Moving Buildings Alternative

This alternative would involve relocating the buildings to another location within the City of Davis where they can be restored and preserved. While this alternative would likely preserve each building, finding a suitable parcel inside the City of Davis may not be possible, the costs of moving each building would be prohibitive, and each building may not be safely moved intact to a new location given their structural condition. This alternative would not likely reduce the effects to each building to a level that the project would be found to be “less than significant: under CEQA, since the new location would dramatically alter the setting of each property, an important part of the building’s historic context.

6. Demolition and New Construction (Preferred Alternative)

The preferred alternative anticipates demolition of the Bryson and Jackson houses and garage, and lot line adjustments to create two parcels of approximately equal width with addresses of 515 and 521 First Street, which will allow for construction of a more compact, consolidated singular fraternity building with a more urban edge, consistent with city planning goals for the neighborhood. The architectural theme recalls the Craftsman Bungalow style of the houses being replaced. During construction, the TX Main House will continue to serve the fraternity’s housing and study needs. Once the new fraternity building is completed, the fraternity will consolidate all of its activities onto the new western parcel, and the TX Main House, along with its expanded lot, will be vacated and made available for another tenant or higher and better use redevelopment proposal. Construction is anticipated to commence in June 2019 and be completed in time for occupancy, when the fall term begins at UCD in September 2020.

Even with adherence to the following mitigation measures, this alternative would not fully mitigate the loss of the properties or historic resources, which are significant for the purposes of CEQA. Therefore, this Alternative would be considered a significant and unavoidable impact.

Proposed Mitigation Measures:

Prior to demolition of the buildings the Applicant shall:

a) Retain a qualified architectural historian, as approved by the City of Davis Planning, Department, to prepare a “Historic Documentation Report.” The report shall include current photographs of each building displaying each elevation, architectural details or features, and overview of the buildings, together with a textual description of the building along with additional history of the building, its principal architect or architects, and its original occupants to the extent that information about those occupants can be obtained. The photo-documentation shall be done in according to Historic American Building Survey/Historic Engineering Record (HABS/HAER) guidelines, which should include archival quality negatives and prints. The final Report shall be deposited with the City of Davis Community Development and Sustainability Department, the Hattie Weber Museum, and the State
Office of Historic Preservation, and other appropriate organizations and agencies as indicated by the Planning Department.

b) Place and maintain a publicly accessible space for a memorial or interpretive plaque/display on or near the former location of the subject properties, identifying the former location of the building, its original owner, and its historic significance.

B. Cumulative Analysis

CEQA Guidelines Section 15130 (a) states that “an EIR shall discuss cumulative impacts of a project when the project’s incremental effects is cumulatively considerable, as defined in CEQA Guidelines Section 15065 (c).” 503 and 509 First Street represent an important class or style of architecture reflective of post-1900 Davis, and while not unique, their location along First Street, formally part of the Lincoln Transcontinental Highway and now a busy thoroughfare, makes them visually important to residents and visitors to the city.

There are, however, other similar Craftsman Bungalow style residential homes in Davis that are of equal or greater architectural significance and the loss of 503 and 509 First Street will not result in the demise of the last building of this type or design in Davis. Other factors that should be considered include the city’s long-range plan for this urban section of Davis, the non-historic contemporary or modern commercial infill across First Street from the subject properties, and the loss of integrity of the Natsoulas Gallery Building at 521 First Street, which when constructed mirrored 515 First Street.

VIII. REFERENCES


Historic Resource Associates. Analysis Study of 503, 509, and 515 1st Street, Davis, Yolo County, California 95616. Prepared for Beta Epsilon Association of Theta Xi, P.O. Box 4450, Davis, CA 95617. October 2016.


